


Date: March 22, 2018

To: Dr. Tony Baldwin, Superintendent

From: Tiffany McCants, Purchasing Officer 

Subject: **AWARD OF CONTRACT FOR CELLULAR PHONE SERVICE FOR BUNCOMBE COUNTY SCHOOLS**

This recommendation is for the purchase of cellular phone service for Buncombe County Schools for the period of July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2020.

After careful review of base bids and evaluation factors such as cost and effectiveness, service area reliability, manageability/management capabilities and acceptance of terms from four bidders, it was determined that the incumbent, US Cellular was the winner. US Cellular's bid offers the best overall value for the Information Technology procurement per N.C.G.S. 143-129.8.

RECOMMENDATION: It is the recommendation of the Director of Technology, Mr. Barry Pace, that the Buncombe County Board of Education awards the purchase of Cellular Phone Service for Buncombe County Schools to US Cellular.

Attached: Bid Tab, Evaluation Matrix

CC: Barry Pace, Director of Technology



PREPARING STUDENTS FOR THEIR TOMORROW

Tony Baldwin, Ed.D., Superintendent

175 Bingham Road, Asheville, NC 28806
 P 828.255.5921 F 828.255.5923
 www.buncombe.k12.nc.us

BID TABULATION
for
Cellular Service for Buncombe County Schools

RFP 5-18

Bid opening February 20, 2018

Bidder / Offeror	Bond	MBE	Base Bid	Unit Price 1 Budget Lines	Unit Price 2 Admin Smartphone Lines	Unit Price 3 Admin Basic Phone Lines	Unit Price 4 Homework Hotspot Lines
U.S. Cellular	N/A	N/A	323,962.00	3.95/line/mo	32.00/line/mo	25.00/line/mo	12.00/line/mo
AT&T	N/A	N/A	352,464.90	6.59/line/mo	48.00/line/mo	DNQ	15.00/line/mo
Verizon	N/A	N/A	415,230.85	8.99/line/mo	48.07/line/mo	28.84/line/mo	12.97/line/mo
Sprint	N/A	N/A	533,880.00	9.00/line/mo	44.99/line/mo	DNQ	34.99/line/mo

Bid tabulation provided by

Tiffany McCants, Purchasing Officer

Buncombe County Public Schools
Technology Services



175 Bingham Road Asheville, NC 28806
Voice (828) 255-5256 Fax (828) 255-5892

RFP 5-18 Provide Cellular Phone Service for Buncombe County Schools
Evaluation Matrix
Bid Opening February 20, 2018, 2:00 PM

Factor	Weight	US Cellular (Incumbent)	AT&T	Verizon	Sprint
	24 Mo. Price Est.	\$323,962	\$352,464	\$415,230	\$533,880
Cost effectiveness and value	40	40	37	34	30
Service area reliability for both voice and data	25	22	16	22	16
Manageability and Management Capability	20	15	15	15	15
Acceptance of Terms	15	13	5	4	5
Total	100	90	73	75	66

Winner: US Cellular – 90 Points

Note: All per line prices below are before taxes and fees and the 24 Month Price Estimates listed in the table above are taken directly from the vendor proposals. **US Cellular**, our incumbent provider, proposed Smartphone lines with unlimited voice and unlimited messaging and 3GB (currently sufficient and throttled unlimited 2G afterwards) of LTE data (w/ free tethering) for **\$32.00/month** (\$37.50/month for 5GB/month of LTE data should we need it) with device upgrade eligibility after only twelve months and competitive device upgrade pricing, Budget (Bus) lines for \$3.95/month w/ \$0.07 per minute with unlimited US Cellular mobile to mobile voice and messaging and free incoming messaging regardless, and Hotspot lines at \$29.99/device for \$12.00/month for 2GB (throttled unlimited 2G afterwards) LTE. The **US Cellular** proposal represented the overall best value in terms of cost, service area, manageability and acceptance of terms. AT&T, Verizon, & Sprint all proposed State Contract or Cooperative (NASPO) Contract Pricing that was simply not as cost effective, even with unlimited data on the SmartPhone lines.

AT&T proposed NASPO (formerly WSCA) Cooperative Purchasing Agreement pricing: (SmartPhone plans start at **\$48.00/month** w/ only 400 minutes pooled w/ \$0.25/minute overage charge w/ unlimited 3G/4G data (\$15/month extra for tethering) and unlimited messaging, Budget (Bus) line pricing was omitted from the proposal (normally \$6.59 w/ \$0.08 per minute), Hotspot lines from \$49.99/device and \$15/month recurring for 1GB or 2GB for \$20/month). AT&T indicated that their response is conditioned on the BCS's willingness to agree to the terms and conditions of the NASPO contract.

Verizon did not return the posted proposal form simply proposing State Contract 915A/ITS-005001 "(Domestic) Nationwide Voice & 3G/4G Data Plans for State of NC: Government Subscribers Only" pricing (proposal pg 7): (SmartPhone plans start at **\$48.07** w/ only 400 minutes pooled w/ \$0.25/minute overage charge w/ unlimited 3G/4G data (\$10/month extra for tethering) and unlimited messaging, Budget (Bus) lines at \$8.99 w/ pricing per minute, Hotspot lines from Kajeet at \$99.97/device and \$12.97/month recurring for only 1GB of pooled data). Verizon essentially took exceptions to provisions indicating that the proposal shall be governed by the terms and conditions in the State Contract.

Sprint proposed State Contract 915A/ITS-005001 "(Domestic) Nationwide Voice & 3G/4G Data Plans for State of NC: Government Subscribers Only" pricing. However, their plans are "Unlimited" plans: (SmartPhone plan is **\$44.99** and comes w/ unlimited voice, unlimited messaging, and unlimited data (limited to 10GB per month for tethering), their Budget (Bus) line "Custom Flat Rate" plan is at \$9 per line w/ pay-as-you go \$0.06 per minute, Hotspot lines \$34.99/month for unlimited data.) Sprint took exceptions to provisions indicating that the proposal shall be governed by the terms and conditions in the State Contract.

Barry Pace, Director of Technology